

DIOPHANTINE EQUATIONS IN RECURSIVE DIFFERENCE

R. L. GOODSTEIN

We determine the general solutions (in natural numbers) of a variety of linear equations involving the recursive difference function $x \dot{-} y$ which has the value 0 when $x \leq y$ and is equal to the excess of x over y when $x > y$. We assume a familiarity with properties of recursive difference, in particular the properties

$$\begin{aligned} x + (y \dot{-} x) &= y + (x \dot{-} y), & x \dot{-} (x \dot{-} y) &= y \dot{-} (y \dot{-} x), \\ (x + y) \dot{-} z &= (x \dot{-} z) + \{y \dot{-} (z \dot{-} x)\}, \\ x &= (x \dot{-} y) + \{x \dot{-} (x \dot{-} y)\} \\ x(y \dot{-} z) &= xy \dot{-} xz. \end{aligned}$$

To illustrate the kind of results to be obtained, we consider first the equation

$$(1) \quad x + (y \dot{-} x) = a.$$

The general solution of this equation is

$$(1^*) \quad \begin{cases} x = a \dot{-} (u \dot{-} v) \\ y = a \dot{-} (v \dot{-} u) \end{cases}$$

where u, v are arbitrary parameters. For if x, y are given by (1*) then

$$\begin{aligned} x + (y \dot{-} x) &= \{a \dot{-} (u \dot{-} v)\} + \{(a \dot{-} (v \dot{-} u)) \dot{-} (a \dot{-} (u \dot{-} v))\} \\ &= a \end{aligned}$$

(consider in turn the cases $u \leq v$, $u > v$), so that equation (1) is satisfied. Conversely, since

$$x = \{x + (y \dot{-} x)\} \dot{-} (y \dot{-} x)$$

and

$$y = \{x + (y \dot{-} x)\} \dot{-} (x \dot{-} y)$$

identically, therefore *any* solution x, y of (1) may be obtained from (1*)

giving u the value y and v the value x . Similarly, the general solution of the equation

$$(2) \quad x \dot{-} (x \dot{-} y) = a$$

is

$$(2^*) \quad \begin{cases} x = a + (u \dot{-} v) \\ y = a + (v \dot{-} u) . \end{cases}$$

We consider next the equation

$$(3) \quad x \dot{-} y = a .$$

The general solution of (3) is

$$(3^*) \quad x = a + \{y \dot{-} (1 \dot{-} a)u\} .$$

For if x satisfies 3* then

$$\begin{aligned} x \dot{-} y &= [\{y \dot{-} (1 \dot{-} a)u\} \dot{-} y] + [a \dot{-} \{y \dot{-} (y \dot{-} (1 \dot{-} a)u)\}] \\ &= a \dot{-} \{y \dot{-} (y \dot{-} (1 \dot{-} a)u)\} \\ &= a \end{aligned}$$

(consider in turn the cases $a=0$, $a \geq 1$) so that all x given by (3*) satisfy (3). Conversely, since

$$x = (x \dot{-} y) + \{y \dot{-} (1 \dot{-} (x \dot{-} y))(y \dot{-} x)\}$$

therefore any solution (x, y) of (3) may be obtained from (3*) giving u the value $y \dot{-} x$.

It follows that the general solution of

$$(3.1) \quad x_1 \dot{-} (x_2 \dot{-} (x_3 \dot{-} \dots - (x_n \dot{-} u_n) \dots)) = u_0$$

is

$$(3.2) \quad x_r = u_{r-1} + \{u_r \dot{-} (1 \dot{-} u_{r-1})v_r\}, \quad 1 \leq r \leq n ,$$

where $u_1, u_2, \dots, u_{n-1}, v_1, v_2, \dots, v_n$ are arbitrary parameters. For if we write u_{n-1} for $x_n \dot{-} u_n$, u_{n-2} for $x_{n-1} \dot{-} u_{n-1}$ and so on up to u_1 for $x_2 \dot{-} u_2$ then also $x_1 \dot{-} u_1 = u_0$, so that

$$x_r \dot{-} u_r = u_{r-1}, \quad 1 \leq r \leq n ,$$

and by (2*) the general solution of this system of equations is (3.2).

We turn next to the equation

$$(4) \quad x \dot{-} a = y \dot{-} b$$

of which the general solution is

$$(4^*) \quad y = (x \dot{-} a) + \{b \dot{-} (1 \dot{-} (x \dot{-} a))u\} .$$

We omit the verification that (4*) satisfies (4). That every solution of (4) is contained in (4*) follows from the identity

$$y = (y \dot{-} b) + \{b \dot{-} (1 \dot{-} (y \dot{-} b))(b \dot{-} y)\}$$

which shows that if (x, y) is solution of (4) then this y may be obtained from (4*) by giving u the value $b \dot{-} y$.

Similarly, the equation

$$(5) \quad a \dot{-} x = a \dot{-} y$$

has the general solution

$$(5^*) \quad y = \{a \dot{-} (a \dot{-} x)\} + \{1 \dot{-} (a \dot{-} x)\}u .$$

The verification that (5*) satisfies (5) is trivial. The generality of the solution follows from the identity

$$y = \{a \dot{-} (a \dot{-} y)\} + \{1 \dot{-} (a \dot{-} y)\}(y \dot{-} a) .$$

The solution of the apparently more general equation

$$(6) \quad a \dot{-} x = b \dot{-} y$$

is readily derived from (5*). For we may suppose, without loss of generality, that $a \leq b$ and so $a = b \dot{-} (b \dot{-} a)$ whence

$$b \dot{-} y = (b \dot{-} (b \dot{-} a)) \dot{-} x = b \dot{-} (x + (b \dot{-} a))$$

of which the general solution is (by (5*))

$$(6^*) \quad y = [b \dot{-} \{b \dot{-} (x + (b \dot{-} a))\}] + [1 \dot{-} \{b \dot{-} (x + (b \dot{-} a))\}]u \\ = \{b \dot{-} (a \dot{-} x)\} + \{1 \dot{-} (a \dot{-} x)\}u .$$

Although the equation

$$(7) \quad x + y = a$$

involves only elementary addition its general solution *in natural numbers* is

$$(7^*) \quad \begin{cases} x = a \dot{-} u \\ y = a \dot{-} (a \dot{-} u) \end{cases}$$

and so depends upon the recursive difference function. That (7*) is a solution of (7) for any value of u follows from the identity

$$(7.1) \quad (a \dot{-} u) + \{a \dot{-} (a \dot{-} u)\} = a$$

and that (7*) is the general solution is shown by the identity

$$\{(x + y) \dot{-} y\} + [(x + y) \dot{-} \{(x + y) \dot{-} y\}] = x + y$$

which reveals that any pair (x, y) which satisfy (7) may be obtained from (7*) by giving u the value y .

From 7.1 we readily derive the general solution of

$$(8) \quad x_1 + x_2 + \dots + x_{n+1} = a .$$

Write $s_0 = 0$, $s_{k+1} = s_k + u_k$ so that

$$s_k = u_1 + u_2 + \dots + u_k$$

where u_1, u_2, \dots, u_n are arbitrary parameters, then the general solution of (8) is

$$(8^*) \quad \begin{cases} x_k = (a \div s_{k-1}) \div (a \div s_k), & 1 \leq k \leq n, \\ x_{n+1} = a \div s_n . \end{cases}$$

For by (7.1)

$$(a \div s_k) + \{(a \div s_{k-1}) \div (a \div s_k)\} = a \div s_{k-1}, \quad 1 \leq k \leq n ,$$

and so, by addition,

$$\sum_{k=1}^n \{(a \div s_{k-1}) \div (a \div s_k)\} + (a \div s_n) = a$$

which proves that (8*) is a solution of (8) for all u_1, u_2, \dots, u_n . Conversely, writing $X_{k+1} = X_k + x_k$, $X_0 = 0$, we have

$$\{X_{n+1} \div X_k\} \div \{X_{n+1} \div X_{k+1}\} = x_{k+1}, \quad 0 \leq k \leq n ,$$

so that any set of values $(x_1, x_2, \dots, x_{n+1})$ which satisfy (8) may be obtained from (8*) by giving u_k the value x_k , $1 \leq k \leq n$.

As a final and rather more difficult example we consider the equation

$$(9) \quad (x_0 \div x_1) + (x_1 \div x_2) + \dots + (x_n \div x_0) = a .$$

The particular case of (9), with $n = 1$,

$$(9.1) \quad (x \div y) + (y \div x) = a$$

has the general solution

$$x = u + a(1 \div v), \quad y = u + a\{1 \div (1 \div v)\}$$

since

$$\{u + a(1 \div v)\} \div [u + a\{1 \div (1 \div v)\}] = a(1 \div v)$$

and, if $\min(x, y) = x \div (x \div y)$, so that $\min(x, y)$ is equal to the lesser of x and y ,

$$\begin{aligned} \min(x, y) + \{(x \div y) + (y \div x)\}\{1 \div (y \div x)\} &= x , \\ \min(x, y) + \{(x \div y) + (y \div x)\}\{1 \div (1 \div (y \div x))\} &= y . \end{aligned}$$

Next we consider the particular case of (9) with $n=2$, namely

$$(9.2) \quad (x \dot{-} y) + (y \dot{-} z) + (z \dot{-} x) = a .$$

Let $[x, y, z]$ denote the left hand side of (9.2), let

$$\min(x, y, z) = x \dot{-} \{x \dot{-} (y \dot{-} z)\} ,$$

so that $\min(x, y, z)$ is equal to the least of x, y, z , let

$$\max(x, y) = x + (y \dot{-} x) ,$$

the greater of x, y , and finally let

$$\mu(x, y, z) = 1 \dot{-} [1 \dot{-} \{x \dot{-} \min(y, z)\}]$$

so that $\mu(x, y, z) = 0$ if $x \leq y$ and $x \leq z$ and $\mu(x, y, z) = 1$ otherwise. Then the general solution of (9.2) is

$$(9.2^*) \quad \begin{aligned} x &= t + [a\mu(u, v, w) \dot{-} \{\max(v, w) \dot{-} u\}] , \\ y &= t + [a\mu(v, w, u) \dot{-} \{\max(w, u) \dot{-} v\}] , \\ z &= t + [a\mu(w, u, v) \dot{-} \{\max(u, v) \dot{-} w\}] , \end{aligned}$$

u, v, w not all equal.

To show that (9.2*) satisfy 9.2 we consider in turn the six cases

$$\begin{aligned} (\alpha) \quad u < v \leq w, \quad (\beta) \quad u \leq w < v, \quad (\gamma) \quad v < w \leq u, \quad (\delta) \quad v \leq u < w, \\ (\epsilon) \quad w < u \leq v, \quad (\xi) \quad w \leq v < u . \end{aligned}$$

In the first case $\mu(u, v, w) = 0, \mu(v, w, u) = \mu(w, u, v) = 1$ so that $x = t, y = t + \{a \dot{-} (w \dot{-} v)\}, z = t + a$ and therefore (9.2), with the same result in the remaining cases. That (9.2*) is the general solution follows from the identity

$$(9.3) \quad x = \min(x, y, z) + \{[x, y, z]\mu(x, y, z) \dot{-} (\max(y, z) \dot{-} x)\}$$

and the two corresponding results obtained by cyclic interchange of x, y, z . Equation (9.3) shows that if (x, y, z) is any solution of (9.2) then the value of x may be obtained from (9.2*) by giving t the value $\min(x, y, z)$ and u, v, w the values x, y, z respectively.

To prove (9.3) we consider six cases of which

$$y \leq x \leq z, \quad y \neq z ,$$

is typical; in this case the right hand side of (9.3) becomes

$$\begin{aligned} y + \{[x, y, z] \dot{-} (z \dot{-} x)\} &= y + \{(z \dot{-} y) \dot{-} (z \dot{-} x)\} \\ &= y + (x \dot{-} y) = x . \end{aligned}$$

The proofs in the remaining cases are similar (or simpler).

Finally, we remark that the general solution of (9) is expressible in the form

$$(9^*) \quad x_i = t + \left[a \mu_i(u_r, n) \div \left\{ \max_i(u_r, n) \div u_i \right\} \right], \quad 0 \leq i \leq n,$$

where not all u_r are equal, $0 \leq r \leq n$,

$$\begin{aligned} \mu_i(x_r, n) &= 1 \div \{1 \div (x_i \div \min(x_r, n))\}, \\ \min(x_r, 0) &= x_0, \quad \min(x_r, n+1) = x_{n+1} \div (x_{n+1} \div \min(x_r, n)), \\ \max(x_r, 0) &= x_0, \quad \max(x_r, n+1) = x_{n+1} + (\max(x_r, n) \div x_{n+1}), \\ x_r^i &= x_r \quad \text{if } r < i, \quad x_r^i = x_{r+1} \quad \text{if } r \geq i, \end{aligned}$$

and

$$\max_i(x_r, 0) = x_0, \quad \max_i(x_r, n+1) = \max(x_r^i, n),$$

so that $\max_i(x_r, n)$ is the greatest value of x_r , $r \neq i$, $0 \leq r \leq n$. The proof follows the same lines as that of (9.2*), the part played by (9.3) being taken by the identity

$$x_i = \min(x_r, n) + \left\{ [x_r, n] \mu_i(x_r, n) \div \left\{ \max_i(x_r, n) \div x_i \right\} \right\}, \quad 0 \leq i \leq n,$$

where $[x_r, n]$ denotes the left hand side of equation (9).